

Prof. Marta Hanson  
314 Welch  
mhanson4@jhmi.edu

Prof. Daniel Todes,  
304 Welch  
dtodes@jhmi.edu

**Medicine (and Science) in History #140.813 A Survey of Historiography**

Department of History of Medicine, Spring 2008

Fridays 1-3, Seminar Room

Requirements: 1 page single-space response to one of the readings each week  
10 page double-space paper on one of four possible projects detailed separately.  
Students may work as a two person team or write the paper individually.

**Week 1 Feb 1 The Footnote in Historical Scholarship**

Anthony Grafton, *The Footnote\*: A curious history* (Cambridge: Harvard Univ., 1997).

**Week 2 Feb 8 Historiography: An Overview of Historical Trends**

Georg Iggers, *Historiography in the Twentieth Century: From Scientific Objectivity to the Postmodern Challenge* (Wesleyan University Press, 1997).

**Week 3 Feb 15 History of the US Historical Profession**

Peter Novick, *That Noble Dream: The "Objectivity Question" and the American Historical Profession* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1988).

Hexter, Gordon, Hollinger, Novick and Ross, *AHR Forum on Novick, The American Historical Review* 96, 3 (1991), pp. 765-708.

**Week 4 Feb 22 History and Social Theory**

Peter Burke, *History and Social Theory* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1992).

**Week 5 Feb 29 One Historian Reacts to Current Trends**

Richard J. Evans, *In Defense of History* (London/New York: W. W. Norton, 1997).

**Week 6 March 7 The Classics: Intellectual History and History of Ideas**

1. Jorge Luis Borges, "Tlon, Uqbar, Orbis Tertius," "The Library of Babel," and "Pierre Menard, Author of Don Quixote," in *Labyrinths*, pp. 3-18, 36-44, 51-58.

2. EITHER 1) Isaiah Berlin, *The Hedgehog and the Fox* (1953),

- OR 2) Paul Kristeller, "Renaissance Concepts of Man" [1965] in *Renaissance Thought and its Sources*, (New York: Columbia University Press, 1979), pp. 165-210.
3. Arthur Lovejoy, *The Great Chain of Being; a study of the history of an idea* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1933), pp. 3-23
  4. John Merz, *A History of European Scientific Thought in the Nineteenth Century*, 3 vols. [1923-1950]. SKIM "Contents of the First Volume," "Contents of the Second Volume," and "On the Vitalistic View of Nature," vol. 2, chapt. 10, pp. 368-464.
  5. Owsei Temkin, "The Scientific Approach to Disease: Specific Entity and Individual Sickness," *The Double Face of Janus* (Baltimore and London: The Johns Hopkins University Press, 1977), pp. 441-455.
  6. William Coleman, "The Cognitive Basis of the Discipline: Claude Bernard on Physiology," *ISIS* 76 (1985), pp. 49-70.
  7. Adrian Wilson, "On the History of Disease Concepts: The Case of Pleurisy," *History of Science* 38 (2000), pp. 271-318.
  8. Rainer Schulte and John Biguenet, "Introduction," *Theories of Translation: An Anthology of Essays from Dryden to Derrida* (Chicago and London: University of Chicago Press, 1992), 1-10.

### **Week 7 March 14 History and Social Theory I: The Annales School**

*Seminar Readings on Annales Conceptions of Time & Space:*

- Fernand Braudel, "Extract from the Preface," *The Mediterranean and the Mediterranean World in the Age of Philip II*, 2 vols. (New York: Harper & Row, 1966 [Paris 1949]). Reprinted in *On History* (Chicago, 1980).
- \_\_\_\_\_. "History and the Social Sciences: The Longue Durée" 25-54 in *On History*, Translated by Sarah Matthews (Chicago: Univ of Chicago Press, 1980).
- Marc Bloch, *The Royal Touch: Sacred Monarchy and Scrofula in England and France* Trans by J.E. Anderson (London, Routledge & K. Paul, 1973 [Paris 1924]). Intro., chs. 1-2, "The beginnings of the touch for scrofula," "The origins of the royal healing power" 1-48, "A critical interpretation of the royal miracle," 231-43.
- \_\_\_\_\_. "History, Men, and Time," 20-47 in *The Historian's Craft*, trans from French by Peter Putnam, (New York: Vintage, 1964 [Knopf 1953]).
- Jacques Le Goff, "Merchant's Time and Church's Time in the Middle Ages," and "Labor Time in the "Crisis" of the Fourteenth Century: From Medieval Time to Modern Time," reprinted in *Time, Work, and Culture in the Middle Ages* (Chicago, 1980 [Paris 1966]): 29-42, 43-52.
- \_\_\_\_\_. *The Medieval Imagination* (Univ. of Chicago Press, 1988 [Paris 1985]). Choose any one of 4 chapters in "Part Two: Space and Time," 47-106.

**NOTE: Spring Vacation March 18-22****Week 8 March 28 Sociology of Knowledge***Seminar Readings*

Emile Durkheim, "Sociology of Knowledge" [1914], in *Selected Writings*, Anthony Giddens, ed., (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1972), 250-268.

Karl Mannheim, *Ideology and Utopia* [1929] (New York: Harcourt Brace, 1936), 1-32.

Steven Shapin, "Discipline and Bounding: The History and Sociology of Science as Seen through the Internalism-Externalism Debate" *History of Science* 30 (1992): 333-369.

Ludwig Fleck, *Genesis and Development of a Scientific Fact*, Bradley Trewn, trans (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1979), Chapter 2.

Ludmilla Jordanova, "The Social Construction of Medical Knowledge," in Frank Huisman and John Harley Warner, eds., *Locating Medical History: The Stories and Their Meanings* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2004), 338-363.

Barry Barnes, David Bloor, and John Henry, *Scientific Knowledge: A Sociological Analysis* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1996), 1-46.

**Week 9 April 4 Marxist Traditions**

Friedrich Engels, *Socialism: Utopian and Scientific* (1880), in Robert Tucker, ed., *The Marx-Engels Reader*, 2<sup>nd</sup> ed. (New York: W. W. Norton, 1978), pp. 683-717.

Antonio Gramsci, "The Intellectuals" [1949], in Q. Hoare and G. N. Smith, trans. and eds., *Selections from the Prison Notebooks* (New York: International Publishers, 1971), 3-23.

David Harvey, *The Condition of Postmodernity: An Inquiry into the Origins of Cultural Change* (Cambridge: Blackwell, 1990), pp. vii, 121-124, 173-188, 327-360.

*And read #1, #2 (Hessen, Zilsel) and any two others:*

1. Boris Hessen, "The Social and Economic Roots of Newton's *Principia*," in Nikolai Bukharin, ed., *Science at the Crossroads* (1931), 151-212.
2. Edgar Zilsel, "The Sociological Roots of Science," *The American Journal of Sociology* 47 (1942), 544-562.
3. Robert Young, "The Historiographic and Ideological Contexts of the Nineteenth-Century Debate on Man's Place in Nature" at <http://human-nature.com/dm/chap6.html>
4. Daniel Todes, "Darwin's Malthusian Metaphor and Russian Evolutionary Thought, 1859-1917" *Isis* 78, 4 (1987), 537-551.

5. Karl Figlio, "Chlorosis and chronic disease in nineteenth century Britain: the social constitution of somatic illness in capitalist society," *Social History* 3 (1978), 167-97.
6. Joseph Needham, "On Science and Social Change," *The Grand Titration: Science and Society in East and West* (Toronto, 1969): 123-153. First published in *Science and Society* 10 (1946): 225- [THIS IS ON SEMINAR WEB PAGE]
7. Stephen Jacyna, "Medicine in transformation, 1800-1849," in W. F. Bynum, et. al. Eds., *The Western Medical Tradition: 1800-2000* (Cambridge: Cambridge UP, 2006), pp. 11-27, 53-101.

### **Week 10, April 9 Social History**

*Seminar reading:*

- E. P. Thompson, *The Making of the English Working Class* (1966), preface and table of contents, pp. 9-13, "Exploitation," pp. 189-212; "Community," 401-447; "Class Consciousness," 711-23, 746-762 (section on Cobbett)
- Susan M. Reverby and David Rosner, "'Beyond the Great Doctors' Revisited: A Generation of the 'New' Social History of Medicine," in *Locating Medical History: The Stories and Their Meanings* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 2004), 167-193.
- Charles Rosenberg, "The practice of medicine in New York a century ago," [1967] in Charles Rosenberg, *Explaining Epidemics and Other Studies in the History of Medicine* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992), 125-54.
- Charles Rosenberg, "Disease and Social Order in America: Perceptions and Expectations," *The Milbank Quarterly* 64, Suppl. 1 (1986), 34-55.
- John H. Warner, "Ideals of Science and Their Discontents in Late Nineteenth-Century American Medicine," *Isis* 82 (1991): 454-478.
- Roy Porter, "The History of Science and the History of Society," in R.C. Olby et. al., eds., *Companion to the History of Modern Sciences* (London: Routledge, 1990), 32-46.
- Arnold Thackray, "Natural Knowledge in Historical Context," *American Historical Review* 79 (1974), pp. 672-709.
- Mark Adams, *Networks in Action: The Khrushchev Era, the Cold War and the Transformation of Soviet Science* (Trondheim: Trondheim Studies on East European Cultures & Societies, 2000) (35 pp.).
- Steven Shapin, "The Invisible Technician," *American Scientist* 77 (1989), 554-563.

### **Week 11 April 18 Cultural History**

*Seminar readings on Microhistory or "The Social Microscope":*

- Clifford Geertz, "Thick Description: Toward an Interpretive Theory of Culture," 1-30, and "Deep Play: Notes on the Balinese Cockfight," 412-453,

- Interpretation of Cultures*, (New York: Basic Books, 1973).
- \_\_\_\_\_, "From the Native's Point of View": On the Nature of Anthropological Understanding," 55-70, *Local Knowledge: Further Essays in Interpretive Anthropology* (New York: Basic Books, 1983).
- Carlo Ginzburg, trans by John and Ann Tedeschi, *The Cheese and the Worms: The Cosmos of a Sixteenth-Century Miller* (Johns Hopkins Univ Press, 1980 [1976]). Read Translators' Note and two prefaces, viii-xxvi, and a range of sections 1-62 of your choosing.
- Robert Darnton, ch. 2 "Workers Revolt: The Great Cat Massacre of the Rue Saint-Séverin," 75-106, *The Great Cat Massacre: And Other Episodes in French Cultural History* (New York: Vintage Books, 1984).
- Carolyn Steedman, *Dust: The Archives and Cultural History* (New Brunswick: Rutgers, 2002). Read as much as you can.

- For History of Medicine:* Read Fissell & Bynum; compare Richardson & Sappol.
- Caroline Bynum, "Why All the Fuss about the Body? A Medievalist's Perspective," in Bonnell and Hunt, eds. *Beyond the Cultural Turn* (1999), 241-280.
- Mary Fissell, "Making Meaning from the Margins: The New Cultural History of Medicine," in John Warner and Frank Huisman, eds., *Medical History: The Stories and their Meanings* (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 2004).
- Ruth Richardson, *Death, Dissection and the Destitute* (London: Penguin, 1988).
- Michael Sappol, *A Traffic of Dead Bodies: Anatomy and Embodied Social Identity in Nineteenth-Century America*. (Princeton, 2002). Ch 8, 238-273.

- For History of Science:* Read Jacob article and compare any other two books.
- Mario Biagoli, *Galileo, Courtier: The Practice of Science in the Culture of Absolutism* (Chicago, 1993).
- Betty Jo Teeter Dobbs, *The Janus Faces of Genius: The Role of Alchemy in Newton's Thought* (Cambridge, 1991).
- Margaret C. Jacob, *The Cultural Meaning of the Scientific Revolution* (New York: Alfred Knopf, 1988).
- \_\_\_\_\_, "Science Studies after Social Construction: The Turn toward the Comparative and the Global," in Bonnell, Hunt, eds. *Beyond the Cultural Turn* (1999), 95-120.
- Marcella Pera and William R. Shea, eds., *Persuading Science: The Art of Scientific Rhetoric* (Canton, Mass., 1991).
- John Pickstone, *Ways of Knowing: A New History of Science, Technology and Medicine* (Univ. of Chicago Press, 2000)
- Frances Yates, *Giordano Bruno and the Hermetic Tradition* (London, 1964).

## **Week 12 April 25 Foucault and Responses to Foucault**

### *Seminar readings:*

- Georges Canguilhem, *The Normal and the Pathological*, translated by Carolyn R. Fawcett in collaboration with Robert S. Cohen (New York: Zone Books, 1989): "Introduction" by Michel Foucault, 7-24, and "A Critical Examination of Certain Concepts: The Normal, Anomaly, and Disease; The Normal and the Experimental," 115-124.
- Foucault, "The Political Technology of Individuals," in *Essential Works of Foucault* (New York: New Press, 2000): 403-417.
- Foucault, "Panopticism," in *Discipline and Punish* (New York: Random House, 1978), 195-228.
- J. Leonard, "The Historian and the Philosopher, Remarks on *Surveiller et punir; naissance de la prison*," in Perrot, ed. *L'impossible prison* (Paris, 1980), 9-28.
- Foucault, "Breathing Dust, Blowing Smoke," Michelle Perrot, ed., *L'impossible prison: Recherches sur le système pénitenciaire au XIXe siècle* (Paris, 1980), 29-39. Response to J. Leonard critique.

## **Week 13 May 2 Historical Imagination, the Linguistic Turn, and Postmodernism**

### *Seminar readings:*

- Joyce Appleby, Hunt, Jacob, "III A New Republic of Learning," *Telling the Truth About History* (New York: W.W. Norton & Co., 1994), 242-309.
- Gabrielle M. Spiegel, "History, Historicism, and the Social Logic of the Text in the Middle Ages," *Speculum* 65 (1990): 56-86.
- Hayden White, *Metahistory: The Historical Imagination in Nineteenth-Century Europe* (Baltimore/London: Johns Hopkins Univ Press, 1973). Introduction and Part One The Received Tradition, 1-132.

*For history of science and technology:* Read intro and any chapter in each text below.

Bruno Latour, *We Have Never Been Modern*, trans. Catherine Porter (Harvard, 1993).

\_\_\_\_\_, *Aramis, or, The Love of Technology*, trans. Catherine Porter (Harvard, 1996).

## **Week 14 May 9 Roundtable on Research Projects**

### **POSSIBLE PROJECTS**

1. Analysis of a debate in History journals:

Since the 1980s four journals have been important forums for the critiques of historical practice from perspectives of postmodernism and linguistic theory:

*History and Theory, The American Historical Review, The Journal of Modern History, and Past and Present.* Take one of these journals and evaluate how this debate has been carried out within its pages. Has the history of science, medicine, and technology had a role to play? Compile a bibliography of what you think are the representative articles, forums, etc., within each journal. You may use the bibliographies in the six texts we have read so far as guides.

2. Critical analysis of Textbooks on the history of medicine or history of science  
Please consult us for a bibliography of possible textbooks.

3. Write a prosopography of range of scholarship and trends among members of AAHM, HHS, SHOT, ISHEASTM. Use the journals, society memberships, newsletters as primary sources to answer the question of the range of historical approaches and theories members have been deploying in past decade or so.

4. Review of trends in historical scholarship as represented by the work of representative historians of science, technology, and/or medicine or in a subject of special interest to you, perhaps even for your own dissertation work. You may discuss how the scholarship of one scholar changed over time methodologically or compare how the scholarship of several scholars represents a particular trend in history.